

Revisiting Eighteenth Amendment and the NFC Awards

December 2021



Revisiting Eighteenth Amendment and the NFC Awards

December 2021



PILDAT is an independent, non-partisan and not-for-profit indigenous research and training institution with the mission to strengthen democracy and democratic institutions in Pakistan.

PILDAT is a registered non-profit entity under the Societies Registration Act XXI of 1860, Pakistan.

Copyright © Pakistan Institute of Legislative Development And Transparency - PILDAT

All Rights Reserved

Printed in Pakistan

Published: December 2021

ISBN: 978-969-558-773-7

Any part of this publication can be used or cited with a clear reference to PILDAT.



Australian Government

Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade

PILDAT
Pakistan Institute of Legislative
Development And Transparency

Islamabad Office: P. O. Box 278, F-8, Postal Code: 44220, Islamabad, Pakistan
Lahore Office: P. O. Box 11098, L.C.C.H.S, Postal Code: 54792, Lahore, Pakistan
E-mail: info@pildat.org | Website: www.pildat.org

CONTENTS

<i>Abbreviations and Acronyms</i>	5
<i>Preface</i>	7
<i>Profile of the Author</i>	9
Introduction	11
Analysis of the Eighteenth Amendment	11
Administrative Decentralization	12
- Labour Welfare	12
- Higher Education	12
- Social Protection and Poverty Reduction	13
- Transfer of Staff	13
Fiscal Federalism through NFC	13
Should the Eighteenth Amendment be Reviewed?	14
Conclusions and the Way Forward	15
List of Tables	
Table 1: Provincial Share in the Divisible Pool	14
Table 2: 7 th NFC Award Horizontal Sharing Formula	14
Annexures	
Annex I: Federal Legislative List PART I	17
Annex II: Federal Legislative List PART II	20

Abbreviations and Acronyms

BD	Basic Democracies
BISP	Benazir Income Support Programme
CCI	Council of Common Interests
CoD	Charter of Democracy
ECP	Election Commission of Pakistan
EOBI	Employees Old Age Benefits Institution
FATA	Federally Administered Tribal Areas
FPSC	Federal Public Services Commission
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
HEC	Higher Education Commission
KP	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
LFO	Legal Framework Order
NFC	National Finance Commission
NWFP	North West Frontier Province
PML-N	Pakistan Muslim League – Nawaz
PPP	Pakistan Peoples Party
ToRs	Terms of Reference

Preface

Revisiting Eighteenth Amendment and the NFC Awards is a PILDAT paper written to contextualize the conversation in Pakistan on some aspects of the Eighteenth Amendment and the NFC Awards. The paper is authored by **Mr. Sartaj Aziz**, Public Intellectual and Pakistan's Former Federal Minister who has held many important portfolios including Finance, Foreign Affairs and National Security.

The paper discusses challenges faced by Pakistan a decade after the Eighteenth Amendment to the Constitution and discusses the context behind the continuing political debate on constitutional and financial powers of the federation and its units and the ToRs of the 10th National Finance Commission.

Acknowledgements

PILDAT has received financial support from the Australian High Commission Pakistan's Direct Aid Programme for the project *Comparative Analysis on Evolution of Federalism in Australia and Pakistan*. The paper is part of a PILDAT initiative to undertake comparative studies on evolution of federalism in Pakistan and Australia to facilitate an informed understanding of key issues amongst stakeholders such as multi-party Pakistani MPs, MPAs and key political parties.

Disclaimer

The views expressed in this paper are those of the author and do not represent the views or perspectives by the Australian High Commission in Pakistan.

Profile of the Author



Mr. Sartaj Aziz is a development economist and an alumnus of Harvard University.

After a distinguished career as a civil servant (1952–71), he began his international career as Director, Commodities and Trade Division, Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO) in Rome. In 1974, he served as Deputy Secretary General of the World Food Conference and was one of the architects of the global food security system, and helped establish the International Fund for Agricultural Development (IFAD). After serving as Deputy Executive Director of the World Food Council and Assistant President, Policy and Planning, IFAD (1978–84), Sartaj Aziz returned to Pakistan to serve as Minister of State for Food and Agriculture for four years. He served twice as Finance Minister (August 1990–June 1993; February 1997–August 1998) and as Foreign Minister (August 1998–October 1999). Later he was elected to serve as member of the Pakistan Senate (1985–99).

He was the first Vice Chancellor of the Beaconhouse National University, Lahore from 2004 to 2013. After the 2013 General Elections, he became Advisor to the Prime Minister on National Security and Foreign Affairs (2013–2017) and later Deputy Chairperson, Planning Commission (August 2017–May 2018).

His publications include: *Industrial Location Policy* (1969), *Hunger, Politics and Markets: The Real Issues in the Food Crisis* (1976), *Rural Development, Learning from China* (1978), *Agriculture Policies for the 90s* (1990), *Privatization in Pakistan* (1996), *Hunger, Poverty, and Development: Life and Work of Sartaj Aziz* (2000), *Parliamentary Oversight of Defence in Pakistan: The Way Forward* (A PILDAT Paper 2010), *Report of the Committee on FATA* (2016) and *Between Dreams and Realities, Some Milestones in Pakistan's History* (2009 and 2020).

Introduction

When the Eighteenth Constitutional Amendment was passed by Parliament on April 19, 2010, it was regarded as a major milestone in the constitutional history of Pakistan because it addressed the critical issue of provincial autonomy and transferred substantial powers and functions from the Federal to the Provincial Governments. It also strengthened the Federal Parliamentary system by securing greater participation of all the federating units.

However, as serious problems slowed down the implementation of reforms visualized under the Eighteenth Amendment in the following years, some political parties and observers began to criticize the reform package as 'over-ambitious'. One view went even further and argued that the Eighteenth Amendment in the long run, may prove to be worse than Sheikh Mujibur Rahman's six points, which eventually led to the breakup of Pakistan in December 1971.

Analysis of the Eighteenth Amendment

An objective analysis of the Eighteenth Amendment would have to start with the recognition, that any federal system based on power sharing between the federating units is always problematic and will be successful only if the unifying factors like identity, language, ethnicity and culture are carefully recognized and nurtured.

The Eighteenth Amendment was promised in the Charter of Democracy signed in London on 14 May 2006, by Benazir Bhutto and Nawaz Sharif. It called for restoring the 1973 Constitution as on 12 October 1999 i.e., before the military coup, with provisions for joint electorate, minorities and women reserved seats on closed party lists, lowering the voting age and increase in seats in parliament. It also called for the repeal of Legal Framework Order (LFO) 2000 and the Seventeenth Amendment.

In Pursuance of this commitment, a Parliamentary Committee on Constitutional Reforms was set up with Senator Raza Rabbani as chairman. After intense deliberations over 18 months, the committee submitted a comprehensive report. On April 19, 2010, the Eighteenth Amendment was passed.

The main features of the Eighteenth Amendment, which incorporated a total of 102 Amendments in the Constitution, are summarized below:

- i. The concurrent list of 47 subjects on which both the Federal Parliament and Provincial Assemblies could legislate was abolished, transferring these subjects to Provincial jurisdiction. However, some items were added to Part-II of the Federal Legislative List by increasing the number of items from 8 to 18. Under Article 154, policies in relation to subjects in Part-II of Schedule-IV are formulated and regulated by the inter-provincial Council of Common Interests (CCI). The Federal Legislative list parts I and II, after the Eighteenth Amendment is reproduced in Annex I.
- ii. The powers and functions of the Council of Common Interests (CCI) were enhanced. In the original 1973 Constitution, a Council of Common Interests was created because after the separation of East Pakistan and the breakup of One Unit in West Pakistan into four Provinces, certain provincial subjects like Railways, Water and Power, Natural Gas and Public Sector Industries had to be federalized. To handle these subjects on behalf of the new Provinces, the special mechanism of CCI was created under the direct supervision of both houses of Parliament. Now after the Eighteenth Amendment, the CCI has also become an important forum for inter-provincial coordination for a broader range of subjects.
- iii. Article 58-2(b) was abolished once again. This article was initially inserted by Gen. Ziaul Haq in March 1985, when he restored the Constitution. It was amended by the Eighth Amendment of October 1985 to reduce the discretion of the President. It was used four times in the next 12 years by Ziaul Haq in 1988 (PM Junejo), by Ghulam Ishaq Khan in 1990 and 1993 (PM Benazir Bhutto and PM Nawaz Sharif respectively) and by Farooq Leghari in 1996 (PM Benazir Bhutto). When Nawaz Sharif won the 1997 Election by two third majority, the Thirteenth Amendment was passed in March 1997 to abolish Article 58-2(b). However General Musharraf re-inserted this Article through the Seventeenth Amendment. The Eighteenth Amendment by repealing this Article once again restored parliamentary sovereignty.
- iv. A new procedure was prescribed for the appointment of Chief Election Commissioner

and other members of the Election Commission to ensure free and fair election.

- v. The provisions of Political Parties Act were extended to Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA), so that members of National Assembly can be elected directly by the voters and not through selected Maliks.
- vi. Many clauses concerning Fundamental Rights and Principles' of Policy were amended to strengthen the rights of women and minorities.
- vii. Similarly, the autonomy of institutions like Auditor General and the Federal Public Services Commission (FPSC) was enhanced to ensure transparency and accountability.
- viii. The name of North West Frontier Province (NWFP) was changed to Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP).
- ix. The fiscal powers of the Provincial Governments were enhanced by transferring sale tax on services (not goods) and taxes on immovable property to the provinces.

An inter-provincial implementation committee was set up to supervise the winding up or transfer of federal ministries and organizations.

Administrative Decentralization

Overall, 17 ministries, 174 functions and 116 organizations were either closed or transferred to the provinces after the passage of the Eighteenth Amendment:

- i. In December 2010, five ministries (Local Government, Population Welfare, Youth, Zakat and Special Education) were wound up and five ministries (Education, Culture, Livestock, Social Welfare and Tourism) were devolved to the provinces.
- ii. In July 2014, another seven ministries (Food and Agriculture, Health, Environment, Sports, Minorities and Women Development) were abolished.

However, soon after these decisions were taken, it was realized that there were certain functions like climate change, health or human rights which had important international dimensions, and these could not be

handled by the provinces alone. Certain other functions like food security and Overseas Pakistanis also required effective coordination at the federal level. Keeping these considerations in view, the following new ministries/divisions were gradually created at the federal level:

- i. Climate Change
- ii. National Health Services
- iii. Narcotics Control
- iv. National Food Security and Research
- v. Overseas Pakistanis
- vi. Social Protection and Poverty Alleviation

As a result, the much needed reduction in the size of the federal government has not been achieved despite substantial administrative decentralization.

Apart from financial considerations and economy in expenditure, many other serious issues have arisen during the implementation of the Eighteenth Amendment. These include the following:

Labour Welfare

This subject, along with the subject of trade unions and unemployment insurance were in the concurrent list of the 1973 Constitution which was abolished by the Eighteenth Amendment. In other words, these became provincial subjects. However, the federal government continues to manage two important funds: the Welfare Workers Fund, and the Employees Old Age Benefits Institution (EOBI). There are substantial amounts in each of these funds, which the provinces are claiming. The issue is pending with the CCI, which has yet to decide if these funds should be provincialized or allowed to continue with the federal government as at present.

Higher Education

Another problematic function is that of higher education. In 2002, the University Grants Commission was converted into the Higher Education Commission (HEC) with an expanding budget to provide funds to about 90 public sector universities in all the four provinces to cover a substantial part of their recurrent expenditures and development budgets. The HEC also started a major program of PHD scholarships and research grants for universities.

After the Eighteenth Amendment, the Government of Punjab and the Government of Sindh set up their own Higher Education Commissions and wanted the Federal HEC to be abolished. The matter went up to the Supreme Court which ruled as follows:

Revisiting Eighteenth Amendment and the NFC Awards

December 2021

- i. Since the new part II of the federal legislative list include subjects of:
 - a. research for professional or technical training or for the promotion of social sciences and
 - b. standards of institutions of higher education and research, scientific and technical education,

the need for a body like the HEC at the federal level will remain.

- ii. Since the HEC was set up under HEC ordinance 2002 which remains in force, it is protected under article 268-1 of the constitution which says “all existing laws shall continue in force, so far as applicable and with necessary adaptation until repealed or amended by the appropriate legislature.

In accordance with these orders, HEC continues to function as a regulatory body, providing recurring and development funding to public sector universities. However, the 9th NFC will have to decide the longer term issue of how public sector universities are to be funded in the future.

Social Protection and Poverty Reduction

The social welfare function as a whole stands devolved to the provinces after the Eighteenth Amendment. However, a sizeable programme of social protection and poverty reduction is being implemented by the Federal Government. This programme actually started in 2009, i.e., before the Eighteenth Amendment was adopted, as Benazir Income Support Programme (BISP), with an initial allocation of Rs. 34 billion to provide a monthly cash supplement of Rs. 1000 to about 2.5 million low income families. The allocation was increased to Rs. 40 billion by 2012-13.

During the tenure of the PML-N government from 2013 to 2018, the size of the programme was increased to Rs. 120 billion by 2017-18 to provide Rs. 1500 per month to 5.6 million families.

After the PTI government took over in August 2018, the programme was expanded into the Ehsas Programme and its size increased to Rs. 260 billion for 2021-22 with many supplementary components like *Kifalat*, *Tahafuz*, shelters for the poor, scholarship, skill development and Ehsas emergency cash.

The Federal Government has also introduced a national health card scheme in which the card holders can

receive free treatment at a public or private hospital up to a certain limit. The scheme, which was initiated in KP Province, and is now being extended to Punjab is jointly funded with the Provincial Government concerned.

Since after the Eighteenth Amendment, all social welfare programs now fall in the provincial domain, should the BISP and now the Ehsas programme be provincialized? And if so, would all the Provincial Governments be able to meet the financial cost of such a large program from the allocations given to them under the NFC.

There is no provision so far that the federal government will provide any additional allocations to the Provincial Governments for any programs transferred to them under the Eighteenth Amendment. It is quite likely therefore, that the size of the program would have shrunk drastically if it had been provincialized. In addition, the system of identifying beneficiaries, use of latest technology for distributing income support and the elaborate monitoring mechanism would be difficult to implement uniformly in all the provinces.

For these reasons, it seems, the Provincial Governments have not so far put forward any plea from provincializing the Ehsas programme. But in the longer term, there is a need for joint programs in which there is a common design, supervised execution and joint funding by both the Federal and Provincial Governments.

Transfer of Staff

It was assumed that the staff working in federal ministries or organizations which had been transferred to the provinces will also be shifted to the respective provinces of their choice. But as the Implementation Commission discovered this proved to be totally formidable, along with the task of redistributing assets and records of those ministries. This was one reason why some of the devolved ministries were recreated at the federal level under a different name.

Fiscal Federalism through NFC

The National Finance Commission (NFC) is a mechanism of fiscal federalism under article 160 of the Constitution through which once every 5 years, the net proceeds of taxes collected by the Federal Government are distributed between the federation and the provinces. The commission consists of the federal and provincial finance ministers and one additional member nominated by each province.

Revisiting Eighteenth Amendment and the NFC Awards

December 2021

An important step for the timely implementation of the Eighteenth Amendment was the 7th NFC award which

No.	NFC Award	Increase in Provincial Share
1.	5 th NFC Award 1997	37%
2.	6 th NFC Award 2006	41.5-46.25%
3.	7 th NFC Award 2009	56.0-57.5%

Ayub Khan allocated even more powers to the central government and the President, even though he was elected indirectly through 80,000 councillors under the system of Basic Democracies (BD). In the provinces, the nominated Governors had more powers than the elected chief ministers under 1956 constitution. This Constitution caused considerable discontent in East Pakistan. Sheikh Mujibur Rehman demanded maximum autonomy under the well-known 6 point formula. When no agreement was reached, East Pakistan became Bangladesh in 1971 with help from the Indian Army.

The 1973 Constitution adopted by the Parliament unanimously was an important milestone towards federalism. It created a Senate with equal seats for all the provinces and also set up a Council of Common Interests for resolving inter-provincial issues. It made an important move towards fiscal federalism by setting up the National Finance Commission.

However the extent of decentralization promised in the 1973 constitution could not be delivered in practice because of two 8-year spells of military rule, under General Zia ul Haq (1977-1985) and General Pervez Musharraf (1999-2008). In fact by assigning the power of dissolving the National Assembly to the President under article 58-2(b), the Parliament was considerably weakened.

In this background, the passage of the Eighteenth Amendment in April 2010, only two years after General Musharraf's rule ended, should be acknowledged as the second important milestone towards federalism, after the first milestone, i.e., the unanimous adoption of the 1973 Constitution.

It is therefore extremely important to avoid any express or implied move that seeks to roll back the main provisions of the Eighteenth Amendment. In fact every effort should be made to address the difficulties that have been encountered in implementing the Eighteenth Amendment.

Some recommendation for this purpose are outlined below:

- i. The Federal Government continues to incur substantial expenditures on subjects that fall squarely in the domain of Provincial Governments. There are still 40 ministries and divisions at the federal level, many of which like health, agriculture and population planning deal with provincial subjects. The 9th NFC should clearly identify such subjects

No.	Criteria	Percentage Allocation
1.	Population	82%
2.	Poverty	10.3%
3.	Revenue generation	5%
4.	Inverse Population Density	2.7%

and ensure that adequate provision is made for such expenditures in the provincial budgets. There are more cost-effective mechanisms to avoid duplication and better coordination.

- ii. At the same time, there are certain programmes or activities for which the role of the Federal Government can be increased to ensure uniformity and better coordination. These include social protection and poverty reduction, higher education and health insurance. The mechanism of CCI can be used to gain the required flexibility for this purpose.
- iii. An important objective of the Eighteenth Amendment and the 7th NFC award was to increase the capacity of Provincial Governments to devote additional resources to education and health, but this has not been achieved. The total expenditure on these sectors have been virtually stagnant for the past few years at 3% of the GDP (education 2%, health 1%), against a UN target of 6%, (education 4% and health 2%). The 9th NFC should examine this issue in depth and agree on financial and physical targets for the next five years for Provincial Governments.
- iv. In certain sectors like water and higher education, the mechanism of matching grants can be used by the Federal Government to achieve accelerated progress in these sub-sectors. These matching grants, over and above the transfers from the divisible pool, can be larger for less developed provinces like Balochistan.
- v. Another important contribution of the Eighteenth Amendment was the addition of articles 140(A) of the Constitution, under which “each province shall by law establish a local government system and devolve political, administrative and financial responsibility and authority to the elected representatives of the local government.” But there have been inordinate delays in establishing elected local governments in all the four provinces. Each province has passed its own local governments legislation between 2012-2015 but in most cases the powers of the local governments were reduced rather than enhanced. Even more serious due to the peculiar conflicts of political interests, elections under these laws

were either not held, despite clear directives of Supreme Court or the local governments elected under one Provincial Government were suspended after a change of that Provincial Government. In view of the varying political obstacles in each province, the Federal Government must show leadership by evolving through consensus, a model local government law which after approved by the CCI, can be legislated in each province with an agreed time limit for holding local government elections.

- vi. The current financial crisis for which Eighteenth Amendment is blamed, without any justification can be addressed only by increasing federal tax revenues. These had increased to 13% of GDP in 2017-2018 but have since declined to 11%. If the target of increasing these revenues to 15% is achieved in the next 4-5 years, the Federal Government will have enough resources to cover its administrative budget, after meeting the requirements of debt servicing and defence.
- vii. The role of the CCI can be further strengthened as visualized under the Eighteenth Amendment if it meets at least once every quarter, and if a separate secretariat is created for the CCI in the Ministry of Inter-Provincial Coordination.

By implementing these and other recommendations emerging from actual experience, we can achieve the paramount objective of improved relations between the Federal and Provincial Governments in the true spirit of the Eighteenth Amendment in the coming years.

Annex I

**Federal Legislative List
PART I**

1	The defence of the Federation or any part thereof in peace or war; the military, naval and air forces of the Federation and any other armed forces raised or maintained by the Federation; any armed forces which are not forces of the Federation but are attached to or operating with any of the Armed Forces of the Federation including civil armed forces; Federal Intelligence Bureau; preventive detention for reasons of State connected with defence, external affairs, or the security of Pakistan or any part thereof; person subjected to such detention; industries declared by Federal law to be necessary for the purpose of defence or for the prosecution of war.
2	Military, naval and air force works; local self- government in cantonment areas, the constitution and powers within such areas of cantonment authorities, the regulation of house accommodation in such areas, and the delimitation of such areas.
3	External affairs; the implementing of treaties and agreements, including educational and cultural pacts and agreements, with other countries; extradition, including the surrender of criminals and accused persons to Governments outside Pakistan.
4	Nationality, citizenship and naturalization.
5	Migration from or into, or settlement in, a Province or the Federal Capital
6	Admission into, and emigration and expulsion from, Pakistan including in relation thereto the regulation of the movements in Pakistan of persons not domiciled in Pakistan; pilgrimages to places beyond Pakistan.
7	Posts and telegraphs, including telephones, wireless, broadcasting and other like forms of communications; Post Office Saving Bank.
8	Currency, coinage and legal tender.
9	Foreign exchange; cheques, bills of exchange, promissory notes and other like instruments.
10	Public debt of the Federation, including the borrowing of money on the security of the Federal Consolidated Fund; foreign loans and foreign aid.
11	Federal Public Services and Federal Public Service Commission.
12	Federal Pensions, that is to say, pensions payable by the Federation or out of the Federal Consolidated Fund.
13	Federal Ombudsmen.
14	Administrative Courts and Tribunals for Federal subjects.
15	Libraries, museums, and similar institutions controlled or financed by the Federation.
16	Federal agencies and institutes for the following purposes, that is to say, for research, for professional or technical training, or for the promotion of special studies.
17	Education as respects Pakistani students in foreign countries and foreign students in Pakistan.
18	Nuclear energy, including: (a) mineral resources necessary for the generation of nuclear energy; (b) the production of nuclear fuels and the generation and use of nuclear energy, and (c) ionizing radiations [; and] [(d) boilers.]
19	Port quarantine, seamen's and marine hospitals and hospitals connected with port quarantine.
20	Maritime shipping and navigation, including shipping and navigation on tidal waters; Admiralty jurisdiction.
22	Aircraft and air navigation; the provision of aerodromes; regulation and organization of air traffic and of aerodromes.
23	Lighthouses, including lightships, beacons and other provisions for the safety of shipping and aircraft.
24	Carriage of passengers and goods by sea or by air.

PILDAT
Background Paper

Revisiting Eighteenth Amendment and the NFC Awards

December 2021

25	Copyright, inventions, designs, trademarks and merchandise marks.
26	Opium so far as regards sale for export.
27	Import and export across customs frontiers as deemed by the Federal Government, inter-provincial trade and commerce, trade and commerce with foreign countries; standard of quality of goods to be exported out of Pakistan.
28	State Bank of Pakistan; banking, that is to say, the conduct of banking business by corporations other than corporations owned or controlled by a Province and carrying on business only within that Province.
29	The law of insurance, except as respects insurance undertaken by a Province, and the regulation of the conduct of insurance business, except as respects business undertaken by a Province, Government insurance, except so far as undertaken by a Province by virtue of any matter within the legislative competence of the Provincial Assembly.
30	Stock exchanges and future markets with objects and business not confined to one Province.
31	Corporations, that is to say, the incorporation, regulation and winding-up of trading corporations, including banking, insurance and financial corporations, but not including corporations owned or controlled by a Province and carrying on business only within that Province, or cooperative societies, and of corporations, whether trading or not, with objects not confined to a Province, but not including universities.
32	International treaties, conventions and agreements and International arbitration.
34	National highways and strategic roads.
35	Federal surveys including geological surveys and Federal meteorological organizations.
36	Fishing and fisheries beyond territorial waters.
37	Works, lands and buildings vested in, or in the possession of Government for the purposes of the Federation (not being military, naval or air force works), but, as regards property situate in a Province, subject always to Provincial legislation, save in so far as Federal law otherwise provides.
39	Establishment of standards of weights and measures.
41	Elections to the office of President, to the National Assembly, the Senate and the Provincial Assemblies; Chief Election Commissioner and Election Commissions.
42	The salaries, allowances and privileges of the President, Speaker and Deputy Speaker of the National Assembly, Chairman and Deputy Chairman of the Senate, Prime Minister, Federal Minister, Ministers of State, the salaries, allowances and privileges of the members of the Senate and the National Assembly, and the punishment of persons who refuse to give evidence or produce documents before committees thereof.
43	Duties of customs, including export duties.
44	Duties of exercise, including duties on salt, but not including duties on alcoholic liquors, opium and other narcotics.
47	Taxes on income other than agricultural income;
48	Taxes on corporations.
49	Taxes on the sales and purchases of goods imported, exported, produced, manufactured or consumed [, except sales tax on services] .
50	Taxes on the capital value of the assets, not including taxes [] on immovable property.
51	Taxes on mineral oil, natural gas and minerals for use in generation of nuclear energy.
52	Taxes and duties on the production capacity of any plant, machinery, undertaking, establishment or installation in lieu of the taxes and duties specified in entries 44, 47, 48 and 49 or in lieu of any one or more of them.

PILDAT
Background Paper

Revisiting Eighteenth Amendment and the NFC Awards

December 2021

53	Terminal taxes on goods or passengers carried by railway, sea or air; taxes on their fares and freights.
54	Fees in respect of any of the matters in this Part, but not including fees taken in any court.
55	Jurisdiction and powers of all courts, except the Supreme Court, with respect to any of the matters in this list and, to such extent as is expressly authorized by or under the Constitution, the enlargement of the jurisdiction of the Supreme Court, and the conferring thereon of supplemental powers.
56	Offences against laws with respect to any of the matters in this Part.
57	Inquiries and statistics for the purposes of any of the matters in this Part.
58	Matters which under the Constitution are within the legislative competence of Majlis- e-Shoora (Parliament) or relate to the Federation.
59	Matters incidental or ancillary to any matter enumerated in this Part.

Note: The Federal Legislative List Part I was reduced under the Eighteenth Amendment from 59 to 54. Two subjects (number 38-census, and 40 extension of the powers and jurisdiction of members of a Police Force belonging to a province) were shifted from Part I to Part II of the Federal Legislative List. Three subjects (33-State Lotteries, 45-Duties in respect of succession to property and 46-Excise Duty in respect of property) were deleted and thus transferred to provinces.

**Federal Legislative List
PART II**

1	Railways.
2	Mineral oil and natural gas; liquids and substances declared by Federal law to be dangerously inflammable.
3	Development of industries, where development under Federal control is declared by Federal law to be expedient in the public interest; institutions, establishments, bodies and corporations administered or managed by the Federal Government immediately before the commencing day, including the [Pakistan Water and Power Development Authority and the Pakistan Industrial Development Corporation] all undertakings, projects and schemes of such institutions, establishments, bodies and corporations, industries, projects and undertakings owned wholly or partially by the Federation or by a corporation set up by the Federation.
4	Electricity.
5	Major ports, that is to say, the declaration and delimitation of such ports, and the constitution and powers of port authorities therein.
6	All regulatory authorities established under a Federal law.
7	National planning and national economic coordination including planning and coordination of scientific and technological research.
8	Supervision and management of public debt.
9	Census.
10	Extension of the powers and jurisdiction of members of a police force belonging to any Province to any area in another Province, but not so as to enable the police of one Province to exercise powers and jurisdiction in another Province without the consent of the Government of that Province; extension of the powers and jurisdiction of a police force belonging to any Province to railway areas outside that Province.
11	Legal, medical and other professions.
12	Standards in institutions for higher education and research, scientific and technical institutions.
13	Inter-provincial matters and co-ordination.
[13.]	Council of Common Interests.
14	Fees in respect of any of the matters in this Part but not including fees taken in any court.
15	Offences against laws with respect to any of the matters in this Parts.
16	Inquiries and statistics for the purposes of any of the matters in this Part.
17	Matters incidental or ancillary to any matter enumerated in this Part.



Islamabad Office: P. O. Box 278, F-8, Postal Code: 44220, Islamabad, Pakistan
Lahore Office: P. O. Box 11098, L.C.C.H.S, Postal Code: 54792, Lahore, Pakistan
E-mail: info@pildat.org | Website: www.pildat.org